

**NATIONAL COMPANY LAW APPELLATE TRIBUNAL**  
**NEW DELHI**

**Company Appeal (AT) No. 187 of 2017**

**IN THE MATTER OF :**

**Dr. Rakesh Shivhare & Ors.**

**... Appellants**

**Versus**

**Sobhagya Hospital & Research Centre  
Private Limited & Ors.**

**... Respondents**

**Present: Dr. U.K. Chaudhary, Senior Advocate with Shri Naveen Dahiya, Shri Mansumyer Singh, Shri Himanshu Vij and Shri Ashok Mehta, Advocates for the Appellants.**

**Shri Animesh Sinha, Advocate for Respondent No. 1.**

**Shri Narendra M. Sharma, Shri Abhishek Sharma and Shri Akshay Arya, Advocates for Respondent No. 2.**

**Shri Manoj Munshi, Advocates for Respondents Nos. 7 to 10.**

**Shri V. Seshagriri and Shri Anchit Tripathi, Advocates for Respondent No. 9.**

**Shri M. Datta, Advocate for Respondent No. 11.**

**WITH**

**Company Appeal (AT) No. 215 of 2017**

**IN THE MATTER OF :**

**Dr. Subodh Jain**

**... Appellant**

**Versus**

**Dr. Sobhagyamal Jain & Ors.**

**... Respondents**

**Present: Shri Ritin Rai, Ms. Manu Aggarwal and Ms. Kritika Bhardwaj, Advocates for the Appellant.**

**Shri M. Dutta, Advocate for Respondent No. 1.**

**Dr. U.K. Chaudhary, Senior Advocate with Shri Naveen Dahiya, Shri Mansumyer Singh, Shri Himanshu Vij and Shri Ashok Mehta, Advocates for Respondent No. 2.**

**Shri Animesh Sinha, Advocate for Respondent No. 5.**

**Shri Narendra M. Sharma, Shri Abhishek Sharma and  
Shri Akshay Arya, Advocates for Respondent No. 6.**

**Shri Manoj Munshi, Advocates for Respondents Nos. 7 to 10.**

**ORDER**

**13.12.2017** Arguments in these appeals for Respondents Nos. 4 to 7 as arrayed in Company Appeal (AT) No. 187 of 2017 are completed. Counsel for Respondent No. 3 as arrayed in Company Appeal (AT) No. 187 of 2017 is partly heard in these appeals.

For further arguments, list on **19<sup>th</sup> December, 2017.**

[Justice A.I.S. Cheema]  
Member (Judicial)

[Balvinder Singh]  
Member (Technical)